

**Gregory Oliver, II**

**v.**

**City and County of San Francisco, et al.**

**Case No. C07-02460 JL**

**Exhibit A**

**to**

**Opposition to Motion to Relate Cases**

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

GREGORY OLIVER, II,

Plaintiff,

vs.

CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN  
FRANCISCO, et al.,

Defendants.

No. C 07-2460 JL

ORDER THAT CASES ARE NOT  
RELATED

C-07-2941 PJH, Maestrini v CCSF  
C-07-2718 WDB, Hwang v CCSF, et al.

The Court received Plaintiff's Administrative Motion to relate Cases pursuant to Civil Local Rule 3-12 and Defendants' opposition to the motion. All parties in the *Oliver* case have consented to this Court's jurisdiction as provided by 28 U.S.C. §636(c) and Civil Local Rule 73.

Civil Local Rule 3-12(a) provides the following definition of related cases:

An action is related to another when:

(1) The actions concern substantially the same parties, property, transaction or event; and

(2) It appears likely that there will be an unduly burdensome duplication of labor and expense or conflicting results if the cases are conducted before different Judges.

1 The Court reviewed the moving and opposing papers and concludes that the cases  
2 should not be related. They involve different plaintiffs. They involve different groups of  
3 defendants. They involve entirely distinct incidents occurring over a period of nine months.  
4 They involve different legal theories. One case involves allegations of false arrest and use  
5 of a baton. Another involves allegations of an unlawful detention, but not an arrest, and the  
6 use of physical force. Yet another involves allegations against two named officers, one who  
7 is not alleged to have been involved in any other incident.

8 No judicial resources would be conserved by relating these cases. There would be  
9 no undue burden on the parties or the Court if they are not related.

10 Accordingly, the motion to relate cases is denied.

11 IT IS SO ORDERED.

12 DATED: August 14, 2007



James Larson  
Chief Magistrate Judge